



GEOLOGICAL & NATURAL HISTORY SURVEY.

Alfred R. C. Selwyn B.L.D., F.R.S., Director.

MUSEUM & OFFICE, SUSSEX ST. OTTAWA.

Fredericton Feb. 13 1886

My dear Sir William,

Your note of the 5th inst, with its enclosures, came to hand a day or two ago, and I take the first opportunity to thank you for the determination of the specimens sent and for the interesting remarks by which they are accompanied. Your opinion of the beds from which the fossils were derived as being probably Lower Helderberg will accord very well with what seems to me to be the true relations of things in that vicinity, although it differs from the view of Sir Wm Logan, who, if I understand him aright, regarded them ^{though doubtless} as a part of the Quebec Group - (Geol. of Canada P. 423 at bottom). I was myself only in doubt as to whether

they and the little-inclined beds of Mt. Missick might not possibly be Devonian. My reference to Mr. Ells' views regarding the Craspe series was based upon his report of 1882 - wherein he says (Page 16 D.D.) "that only about 160 feet can with propriety be assigned to the Silurian, while the preponderance of fossils of Devonian aspect even in the basal bed, renders it probable that the whole may ultimately be transferred to the Devonian system." I see however that he has modified this view in his later report, which I had not very carefully perused at the time that I wrote -

I am glad to learn that you think well of my proposed plan of making a comparative review of the Silurian system in northern N. B. Quebec and Maine, and now that I have got fairly to work upon the subject, feel still more assured that it will prove to be one of interest - I only regret

that my data are less complete than I could wish. The rocks of Lake Temiscouata are literally packed with fossils but they are somewhat difficult to remove - and more time than I had at my disposal would be needed to make anything like a proper collection of them - Sir Wm. refers to their abundance, but does not seem to have collected any number of them. It seems to me that the whole section from Little Falls to Riviere du Loup requires careful revision - I shall at all events try to show that necessity and trust that I may be able to be present at the meeting - and, with yourself and Mr. Ells, take part in any discussion to which it may give rise -

While writing I would like to say a few words on another topic - You have of course seen Dr. Wadsworths and Prof. Whitney's volume on the Azois System (being one of the Bulletins of the Museum of Comp. Zoology at Cambridge - and in which the

work and the remarks of Canadian geologists are so indiscriminately and harshly condemned. Our own work in this Province having been treated at length and with special severity, I could not but feel that some answer to the charges should be made, and the facts of the case be put more nearly in their true light. With this object in view, I penned a reply, which I send herewith, and forwarded it to "Science" for publication, thinking that it would thus appear quickly and near the place where the charges answered were themselves made. It proved unavailing however for the purposes of that periodical and, at my request, was handed over by Mr. Scudder to the Boston Society of Nat. Hist. of which I am both a member and a Patron. Here it remained for months without my hearing anything more of it, until at last I received a note saying that they too were unable to pub-

look it as being directly controversial, and not in reply to anything appearing in their own publications - I do not know whether or not Dr. Wadsworth may have influenced this result, but it certainly seems unfortunate that such statements as are made by him should go unchallenged. It is for this reason that I send you my answer, and would be greatly obliged to you for your advice concerning it. Is it worth while now, after so long a period has elapsed, to take any further notice of the matter - or if it is, what would be the best channel available for its publication?

I am

my dear Sir W^m

Sincerely yours

L. N. Badley

Prof. Bondy
Feb 186