



Mrs

Proposed letter to Naturalists

Objective is that it forces British
Commissioners

1. to divulge conclusions in Report
[for which a case & do search
blame U.S. Commission]

2. to divulge details put forward
in U.S. case.

Museum to
check exhibits

Attention

A. Write to six Naturalists who reply
of Mexican that Belgian section
must be abolished - a letter simply
asking their opinion on a new
element of prob.

B. Contact ourselves by consulting
Naturalists on our findings
(talking them into committee
to deal in properly the case)

It now appears, that Dr. Werrain,
 one of the Commissioners for the
 U.S., in advance of the meeting of
 the arbitrators, ~~had~~ formulated a
 series of statements which in effect
 constitute an abstract of the
 report of ~~the~~ ^{the} Commissioners for the U.S.
~~Commissioner~~ ~~Dr. Werrain~~,
 transmitting these to himself, among
 other documents of reference, &
 asking for an opinion on the
 general question, in the on the
 basis of ~~the~~ ^{the} statements therein contained.
 Some of the more important
 statements made by Dr. Werrain in
 his circular letter, may be
 set out as follows. —



It will be noticed that

no allusion ~~to any~~ is made 3
to the fact that

The British Commissioners had,
~~however~~ arrived at different

Conclusions on any of the above
points. ~~The fact no allusion~~

~~is made in the Circular letter~~
~~referred to.~~

Though the ~~same~~ agreements referred
to in connection with the
Treaty of Arbitration render it
improper at the present moment to

place the details & facts ascertained
in the course of our investigations
before you, for the purpose of
asking your judgment upon ~~them~~ ^{these},

you will greatly oblige by stating,
at your earliest opportunity,
whether the opinions given by you
in reply to Dr Werriam's ~~Circular~~
letter were dependent in whole or
in part on the supposition that

the statements contained in it
were undisputed, & whether the
above outline of the Conclusions

arrived at by the British Commission
is (as it is believed) ~~correct~~
are substantiated by facts,

would come you in any way
to modify the ~~views~~ views
expressed in your reply to
Dr Werriam.

after prolonged inquiry
in the North Pacific
and especially on the both
the Pribiloff and Commander
Islands,

For instance, ^{set out} in the
following are among
some of the conclusions
which seemed to them
proved by the evidence
and documents
obtained; -

Here follow 4

Draft

Letter from Mr. Tupper
to
Naturalists whose opinions
are given in U.S. Case.

DRAFT.

FOREIGN OFFICE, LONDON, S.W.,

Sir,

It appears that Dr. C. Hart Merriam, one of the United States' Behring Sea Commissioners, addressed a circular letter dated April 2nd, 1892, to ~~some~~ leading naturalists in various parts of the world for the purpose of obtaining their views as to the best method of preserving the fur-seals of Alaska.

This letter contained an outline of the results of an investigation conducted by Dr. Merriam and Professor Mendenhall, the other United States' Commissioner.

Your reply to this circular is appended to the Case of the United States before the Tribunal of Arbitration which is to convene at Paris, under the provisions of the Treaty between the United States and Great Britain, concluded on the 29th of February, 1892.

In his circular letter Dr. Merriam makes the following among other statements:

1. That the fur-seal migrates from Behring Sea into the North Pacific in Winter;
2. That there exist separate herds of fur-seals;
3. That cows arrive early in June, and take their places on the rookeries between June 12th and the end of that month;
4. That a single young is born in each instance, and that the young are equally divided as to sex at birth;
5. That each male serves 15 to 25 females;
6. That copulation takes place on land, and that after the birth of the pups the cows leave and go for food;
7. That cows when nursing, and non-breeding seals, regularly travel long distances to feed;
8. That they are commonly found 100 or 150 miles from the Islands;
9. That the non-breeding male seals, together with a few old

bulls remain until January: ~~xxxxxxx~~

10. That the fur-seal is present at the Pribyloff Islands .
8 or 9 months of the year, and, in mild Winters, sometimes
during the entire year;
11. That 90% of the seals killed by pelagic sealers on the
coast are pregnant females;
12. That many more seals than are killed sink before they
are reached;
13. That pelagic sealing is 'des'tructive work';
14. That females killed in Behring Sea are ^{nursing} ~~xxxxxx~~ females
and that the dead pups seen in 1891 died because of the loss
of their mothers;
15. That pelagic sealing is carried on in the North Pacific
Ocean from January until late in June, and in Behring Sea in
July, August and September;
16. That on the Islands neither females nor breeding males
are killed;
17. That there is no evidence that there has been a lack of
males on the Islands; and,
18. That there has been no waste of the seal herd nor im-
pairment of the productiveness of the breeding stock on the
Islands.

You will place me under great obligation by informing
me, at your earliest opportunity, whether the opinion given by
you in reply to the, above circular letter depended upon the
correctness of any or all of the above statements.

I have the honour to be, Sir,

Your most obedient, humble servant,

CHARLES H. TUPPER,

Agent of H. B. M. under the abovementioned
Treaty, concluded, 29th February, 1892.

Draft Letter to Naturalists.



with a view to the determination of
~~In consequence~~ of the questions
which had arisen between Great
Britain and the United States
in respect to sealing in the
North Pacific, a Convention was
entered into by these two Powers
on ~~the~~ Feb. 29. 1892, for the
settlement of these questions
by means of arbitration, and
provision was made for the
appointment of a Joint
Commission to inquire into the
facts relating to the fur-seal
in the North Pacific.

The Commissioners on the
part of Great Britain were Sir
^{Robt. Kewley}
G. Baden-Powell ^{and} Dr. G. M. Dawson,
^{Civil Eng., F.R.S.}
and on the part of the United
States, Professor T. C. Mendenhall
and

and Dr. C. Hart Merriam.

^{Clause IX of}
In the Treaty of Arbitration

it was provided ~~that~~:-

"These Reports shall not be made
public until they shall be submitted
to the Arbitrators, or it shall
appear that the contingency of
their being used by the Arbitrators
cannot arise."

In consequence of this provision
~~which resulted~~ the British Commission,
while prosecuting inquiries in
every direction, did not feel
justified in placing their ~~own~~
conclusions in regard to
the points in dispute before
Naturalists for their opinions,
although it was foreseen that such
reference might eventually be
considered advisable by the
Arbitrators.

~~Understand~~
But It now appears, that Dr. C. A. Merriam,
one of the Commissioners for the United
States, ^{Some} ~~many~~ ^{months} in advance of the meeting
of the Arbitrators, ^{did} formulate a
series of statements which in
effect constitute an abstract of
the Report of the United States
Commissioners; ^{and did transmit} ~~transmitting~~ these
(in the form of a circular letter)
to yourself, among other Naturalists
of eminence, ^{in the} ~~and~~ asking for an
^{involved,}
opinion on the several questions
on the basis of the statements ~~transmitted~~
contained in his letter.

~~As your reply has not~~

Some of the more important
statements made by Dr. Merriam
in this circular letter, may be
set out as follows:

from the
Pribiloff Is.

Female &
 pups by
text

(1) That cows when nursing regularly
Travel long distances to feed, and
that they are commonly found
100 or 150 miles from the Islands.

(2) That the fur-seal is present
at the Pribiloff Islands 8
or 9 months of the year,
and in mild winters almost
the entire year.

(3) That 90% of the seals killed
by pelagic sealers on the coast
are pregnant females; that females
killed in Behm Sea are ^{pregnant in winter} nursing
females, and that they ^{are} ~~are~~ ^{observed} ~~observed~~
of pups on the Pribiloff Islands
in 1891, ^{was the result of the} ~~was caused by their~~
killing at sea of such water seals
~~mothers being killed at sea.~~

? if anything about
lives of sea.
3rd corrected and!

(4) That destruction of seal life
caused by ^{sealing at sea on the} ~~pelagic sealers~~ ^{high seas}
(pelagic sealing)
is alone sufficient to explain
the present depleted condition
of the rookeries on the Pribiloff
Islands.

Inuit

murres

- (1) That it is unlikely that the females go for any considerable distance from the Islands to feed till after the middle of September.
- (2) That the period during which the seals may be said to remain on shore does not exceed 3 or 4 months and that only stragglers remain after that time.
- (3) That while the portion of the pelagic catch most destructive to seal life is that upon the coast giving to a certain proportion of pregnant cows being killed at that time, the seals killed by pelagic sealers in Behm's Sea are to a almost entirely non-breeding i.e. young males or barren females.

That owing to the date on which the sealing schooners had been driven out of B. Sea in 1891, it was impossible that they could have been the cause of the dead pups seen on the Pribilof Islands in August and September of that year.

That ample evidence is forthcoming to show that the methods practiced on the Pribilof Islands themselves are chiefly accountable for the decrease of seals observed on & about these islands, & that a search of birds & mammals inland by the swarms slaythas of animals of that sea upon the islands is one of the most serious features of the existing condition.

- (4) That the destruction of seals caused by pelagic sealing has been only subsidiary to that caused by the excessive killing of male seals upon the Pribiloff Islands since the year 1867.
- (5) That ~~it is only~~ ^{except} the proper proportion of cows to each bull should not exceed 15, and that the bulls lose their powers after a few years of service on the rookeries.
- (6) That the methods employed on the Islands ~~have~~ are to a great extent responsible for the decrease in the number of seals, which ^{was noticed} began before pelagic sealing began.



(5) That each male seal serves
15 to 25 females.

(5) ~~(6)~~ That no evidence exists
that by the methods
employed on the Islands
there has been ~~any~~ either
waste of seal life, or that
the productiveness of the
breeding stock has been
impaired.

Can we
improve
this.

Concurrently investigated
the matters connected
with the ~~life~~ fur-seal
life in

S

It will be noticed that no
allusion is made in Dr. Merriam's
letter to the fact that the

British Commissioners had ~~also~~
~~conducted~~ ^{investigations}
~~held a prolonged campaign~~ ⁱⁿ

the North Pacific, and

~~especially on both the Linnæus~~

~~Pringle and Commodore~~
~~Islands.~~ ^{at which they arrived} The conclusions ^{on}

many of the above points
vary considerably from those
of the U. S. Commissioners,

(for instance) the following are
some of the facts which
seemed to them to be proved
by the evidence ^{they obtained} and ^{the}
observations ~~obtained~~ ^{they made}.

Though, as already stated,
 in connection with the Treaty of
 Arbitration, render it ^{improper} at the
 present moment to place the
 details and facts ascertained
 in the course of ~~our~~ ^{the} investigations
 of the British Commissioners,
 before Naturalists, for the purpose
 of asking their judgment upon
 these ^{TP} ~~things~~ ^{things} you will ^{therefore} greatly oblige

by stating, at your earliest
 convenience, whether the opinion
 given by you in reply to Dr.

Memran's letter were dependent
 in whole or in part on the
 supposition that the
 statements contained in ^{that letter} it were
 not undisputed, and whether
 the fact that many of them are held
~~the above outline of the~~
 to be erroneous or open to question
conclusion

it may be stated that
 in several important
 particulars the ~~conclusions~~
 differ ^{widely} from those
 furnished by Dr Memran
 in his circular letter

The British Commissioners
 in effect find inter alia:—
 (insert here)

9

Though, as already stated,
 in connection with the Treaty of
 Arbitration, render it ^{improper} at the
 present moment to place the
 details and facts ascertained
 in the course of ~~our~~ ^{the} investigations
 of the British Commissioners,
 before Naturalists, for the purpose
 of asking their judgment upon
 these ^{TP} ~~things~~ ^{things} you will ^{therefore} greatly oblige

by stating, at your earliest
 convenience, whether the opinion
 given by you in reply to Dr.

Memran's letter were dependent
 in whole or in part on the
 supposition that the ~~the~~ ^{that letter}
 statements contained in it were
 not undisputed, and whether
 the fact that many of them are held
~~the above outline of the~~
 to be erroneous or open to question
conclusion

it may be stated that
 in several important
 particulars ~~the~~ ^{the} ~~conclusions~~
 differ ~~my~~ ^{my} ~~widely~~ ^{widely} from those
 furnished by Dr Memran
 in his circular letter

The British Commissioners
 in effect find inter alia:—
 (insert here)

9

~~conclusions arrived at by the~~
~~British Commissioners, if~~
~~(as it is believed) they are~~
~~substantiated by facts, would~~
cause you in any way to
modify the views expressed
in your reply to Dr. Thémelin.